

Department of Permitting and Inspections

Zoning Division
645 Pine Street
Burlington, VT 05401
www.burlingtonvt.gov/pz
Phone: (802) 865-7188
Fax: (802) 865-7195

*William Ward, Director
Scott Gustin, AICP, CFM, Principal Planner
Mary O'Neil, AICP, Principal Planner
Ryan Morrison, Associate Planner
Layne Darfler, Planning Technician
Alison Davis, Zoning Clerk
Theodore Miles, Zoning Specialist
Charlene Orton, DPI Administrator*



MEMORANDUM

To: The Design Advisory Board
From: Mary O'Neil, AICP, Principal Planner
RE: ZP20-0875CA; 115- 117 North Union Street
Date: July 28, 2020

File: 20-0875CA
Location: 115-117 North Union Street
Zone: RM **Ward:** 2C
Parking District: Neighborhood
Date application accepted: May 13, 2020
Revised Application received: June 1, 2020
First DAB Review: June 9, 2020
Revised plans received: July 20, 2020.
Applicant/ Owner: Daniel Cockerline/Skipjack Building; Gerard Williams
Request: Renovation of carriage house to create a new residential unit on the second floor; construction of a small cottage for another residential unit (total of five); reconfiguration of driveway and parking areas, fence and landscaping.

Background:

- **Zoning Permit 19-1013CA;** replace window. June 2019.
- **Zoning Permit 19-0900CA;** change of use from duplex to triplex. June 2019.

Overview: The third unit of 115-117 North Union Street was legitimized with a zoning permit last year. New owners wish to add a fourth unit in the 2nd floor of the existing carriage barn, which is included in the description of the property on the Vermont State Register of Historic Resources. A fifth unit is proposed for a newly constructed, detached cottage. Parking areas reconfiguration and new landscaping is included with the application. Depending upon the favorability of the site plan, a parking waiver may be requested of the DRB.

Part 1: Land Division Design Standards

No land division is proposed as part of this application. Not applicable.

Part 2: Site Plan Design Standards

Sec. 6.2.2 Review Standards

(a) Protection of Important Natural Features:

There are significant, mature trees that line the north and south property boundaries of this parcel. The relocation of the carriage barn avoids those originally proposed for removal along the southerly line, but a parking area is illustrated in its stead. The applicant will need to identify the species and maturity of those trees prior to review by the DRB of their removal.

(b) Topographical Alterations:

No topographical alterations are defined within the project application.

(c) Protection of Important Public Views:

There are no protected important views from or through this property. Not applicable.

(d) Protection of Important Cultural Resources:

Burlington's architectural and cultural heritage shall be protected through sensitive and respectful redevelopment, rehabilitation, and infill. Archeological sites likely to yield information important to the city's or the region's pre-history or history shall be evaluated, documented, and avoided whenever feasible. Where the proposed development involves sites listed or eligible for listing on a state or national register of historic places, the applicant shall meet the applicable development and design standards pursuant to Sec. 5.4.8(b).

See Section 5.4.8, below.

(e) Supporting the Use of Renewable Energy Resources:

No part of this application precludes the use of wind, solar, water, geothermal or other renewable energy resource.

(f) Brownfield Sites:

This address is not listed on the Vermont DEC website for identified Brownfields.

(g) Provide for nature's events:

Special attention shall be accorded to stormwater runoff so that neighboring properties and/or the public stormwater drainage system are not adversely affected. All development and site disturbance shall follow applicable city and state erosion and stormwater management guidelines in accordance with the requirements of Art 5, Sec 5.5.3.

Design features which address the effects of rain, snow, and ice at building entrances, and to provisions for snow and ice removal or storage from circulation areas shall also be incorporated.

The applicant has provided an Erosion Prevention and Sediment Control Plan for review by the Stormwater engineering program. Revised plans were forwarded to that Division 7.22.2020. Their review and written approval will be a condition of any permit.

From the site plan, it appears that an entrance canopy is provided on the cottage, but as no building elevation was provided, it cannot be confirmed. There is no identified entrance canopy at the carriage barn, but if providing interior parking, could reasonably afford shelter for residents as they exit their vehicles within the structure.

(h) Building Location and Orientation:

The carriage barn is in a pre-existing location on the site. The cottage is proposed on the southerly side of the entrance drive, now moved further west. In that manner, it reinforces the detached and secondary nature of its addition to the collective site.

(i) Vehicular Access:

Access will remain as existing, from North Union Street via an elongated driveway.



(j) Pedestrian Access:

There are no identified pedestrian paths between the new residential unit(s) and the parking areas, which are required. The parking for the carriage barn unit (within the building) eliminates that necessity; but a walkway needs to be identified, and marked between the cottage and its assigned parking spaces.

(k) Accessibility for the Handicapped:

The applicant has provided information that the building inspector has determined that the expanded use may not require ADA satisfaction due to the separate nature of the dwellings. This remains under the jurisdiction of the building inspector.

(l) Parking and Circulation:

Within the Neighborhood Parking District, 2 parking spaces are required for each residential unit. For five units, 10 parking spaces are required. The plan rearranges the parking areas; and has provided not less than three options for parking 6, 8 or 10 vehicles. The six-space option assumes use of the first floor of the carriage barn as something different from parking.

Consulting **Table 8.1.11-1, Minimum Parking Dimensions** all illustrated parking is compact (8' x 18'). Inadequate back-up space (24' required for standard size, 20' required for compact) remains problematic.

The revised plan introduces a pervious surface (material unidentified) in front of the carriage barn, intended to be a back-up space for carriage house parking. If parking occurs on that pad, it

will count fully as coverage, and not be eligible under the 10% bonus provision of the ordinance relative to coverage.

(m) Landscaping and Fences:

The new site plan(s) are not clearly annotated to understand if landscaping or fencing is proposed along property boundaries. Screening will be required to prevent headlight trespass onto neighboring properties.

(n) Public Plazas and Open Space:

There are no public plazas required, but the site plan illustrates areas for resident outdoor enjoyment. The pervious pavement area immediately in front of the carriage barn could provide a nice patio area for that unit.

(o) Outdoor Lighting:

Where exterior lighting is proposed the applicant shall meet the lighting performance standards as per Sec 5.5.2.

No lighting information has been provided, and is required. Building sketches illustrate gooseneck lamps on the carriage house. Fixture information and illumination levels are still required.

(p) Integrate infrastructure into the design:

Exterior storage areas, machinery and equipment installations, service and loading areas, utility meters and structures, mailboxes, and similar accessory structures shall utilize setbacks, plantings, enclosures and other mitigation or screening methods to minimize their auditory and visual impact on the public street and neighboring properties to the extent practicable.

Utility and service enclosures and screening shall be coordinated with the design of the principal building, and should be grouped in a service court away from public view. On-site utilities shall be place underground whenever practicable. Trash and recycling bins and dumpsters shall be located, within preferably, or behind buildings, enclosed on all four (4) sides to prevent blowing trash, and screened from public view.

Any development involving the installation of machinery or equipment which emits heat, vapor, fumes, vibration, or noise shall minimize, insofar as practicable, any adverse impact on neighboring properties and the environment pursuant to the requirements of Article 5, Part 4 Performance Standards.

The location of mailboxes, utility connections, meters, and mechanical equipment must be identified on the site plan and building elevations as appropriate. All new electrical service shall be undergrounded.

Part 3: Architectural Design Standards

Sec. 6.3.2 Review Standards

(a) Relate development to its environment:

1. Massing, Height and Scale:

The carriage house is existing; no change to its massing is proposed. The proposed addition of a minor detached structure is consistent with a secondary accessory building, and does not conflict with the massing, height or scale of the existing principal dwelling.

2. Roofs and Rooflines.

The carriage barn roof will retain the same configuration and centered gable as it enjoys now. The roof of the cottage is illustrated as a gable and eaves-front structure, consistent with accessory structures. A very informative historic photo has been submitted, identifying a small garden structure in that location and with a similar orientation.

3. Building Openings

Carriage barn:

In general, building openings are in the same location, some enlarged beyond their existing rough openings. In particular, the window under the center gable has been enlarged to accommodate a multi-paned casement window, which by its enlargement encroaches into a notable gable detail of the original barn. The DAB had previously supported this alteration. No new building elevations have been submitted in this revised packet.

Another under-eave window has been added (presumably for symmetry), and a small window on the front (east) first floor elevation has been removed. The three carriage barn doors on the first floor (east) have proposed to be replaced with large garage doors (illustration for “open doors” looks like glass panels.) A spec sheet has been provided for these carriage house doors.

The second floor south window is proposed to be replaced with a double patio door, entering onto a curvilinear deck, supported by two braces. The north elevation proposes installation of two new double hung windows. No openings are proposed for the west; presumably, to meet code as the building sits close to the property line.

Cottage:

The cottage has minimal openings, with the largest on the west elevation where a patio is proposed. Spec sheets for the windows have been submitted. No new building elevations were received.

(b)Protection of Important Architectural Resources:

Burlington's architectural and cultural heritage shall be protected through sensitive and respectful redevelopment, rehabilitation, and infill. Where the proposed development involves buildings listed or eligible for listing on a state or national register of historic places, the applicant shall meet the applicable development and design standards pursuant to Sec. 5.4.8. The introduction of new buildings to a historic district listed on a state or national register of historic places shall make every effort to be compatible with nearby historic buildings.

See Section 5.4.8, below.

(c) Protection of Important Public Views:

There are no protected important views from this property. Not applicable.

(d)Provide an active and inviting street edge:

No changes are included for the principal building, but the reconfigured access drive and parking areas will introduce visual access to the cottage.

The new parking areas had been proposed to be screened with landscaping. If a fence or other landscaping is continued to be proposed, more definition is needed.

(e) Quality of materials:

All development shall maximize the use of highly durable building materials that extend the life cycle of the building, and reduce maintenance, waste, and environmental impacts. Such materials are particularly important in certain highly trafficked locations such as along major streets, sidewalks, loading areas, and driveways. Efforts to incorporate the use of recycled content materials and building materials and products that are extracted and/or manufactured within the region are highly encouraged.

The cottage will be sheathed in white cedar shingles and solid pine trim board. Roofing appears to be asphalt shingle. The material of the carriage house deck has not been provided. The large area in front of the carriage house is identified as pervious surface. If intended as part of the 10% bonus provision of the ordinance, this patio will have to be designed and maintained to infiltrate the 1-year/24-hour storm event onsite, subject to review and approval by the Stormwater Administrator. If intended for parking, it will count as full coverage.

(f) Reduce energy utilization:

All new construction shall meet the Guidelines for Energy Efficient Construction pursuant to the requirements of Article VI. Energy Conservation, Section 8 of the City of Burlington Code of Ordinances.

(g) Make advertising features complementary to the site:

Any signage will require a separate zoning permit.

(h) Integrate infrastructure into the building design:

See Section 6.2.2. (p), above.

(i) Make spaces secure and safe:

Redevelopment is subject to all applicable building and life safety codes as defined by the Burlington's Building Inspector and the Fire Marshal.

Sec. 5.4.8 Historic Buildings and Sites

The City seeks to preserve, maintain, and enhance those aspects of the city having historical, architectural, archaeological, and cultural merit. Specifically, these regulations seek to achieve the following goals:

- *To preserve, maintain and enhance Burlington's historic character, scale, architectural integrity, and cultural resources;*
- *To foster the preservation of Burlington's historic and cultural resources as part of an attractive, vibrant, and livable community in which to live, work and visit;*
- *To promote a sense of community based on understanding the city's historic growth and development, and maintaining the city's sense of place by protecting its historic and cultural resources; and,*
- *To promote the adaptive re-use of historic buildings and sites.*

(a) Applicability:

These regulations shall apply to all buildings and sites in the city that are listed, or eligible for listing, on the State or National Register of Historic Places.

As such, a building or site may be found to be eligible for listing on the state or national register of historic places and subject to the provisions of this section if all of the following conditions are present:

1. *The building is 50 years old or older;*
2. *The building or site is deemed to possess significance in illustrating or interpreting the heritage of the City, state or nation in history, architecture, archeology, technology and culture because one or more of the following conditions is present:*
 - A. *Association with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of history; or,*
 - B. *Association with the lives of persons significant in the past; or,*
 - C. *Embodiment of distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or representation of the work of a master, or possession of high artistic values, or representation of a significant or distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction; or,*
 - D. *Maintenance of an exceptionally high degree of integrity, original site orientation and virtually all character defining elements intact; or,*
 - E. *Yielding, or may be likely to yield, information important to prehistory; and,*
3. *The building or site possess a high degree of integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association*

The carriage barn at 115-117 North Union Street is listed, with the principle building, on the Vermont State Register of Historic Resources. See attached listing sheet. Therefore, the standards of Section 5.4.8 apply for alterations to the carriage barn.

(b) Standards and Guidelines:

The following development standards, following the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, shall be used in the review of all applications involving historic buildings and sites subject to the provisions of this section and the requirements for Design Review in Art 3, Part 4. The Secretary of the Interior's Standards are basic principles created to help preserve the distinctive character of a historic building and its site. They are a series of concepts about maintaining, repairing and replacing historic features, as well as designing new additions or making alterations. These Standards are intended to be applied in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility.

1. *A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.*

The carriage barn was traditionally used as an accessory structure to the primary dwelling. Conversion to residential use has been successful in other applications, with some allowances for alteration. In this instance, replacement of the central 2nd story bay with an oversized casement window alters by intrusion into the gable ornament specific to this building (and notable because this was constructed for Edward Booth, manage of the Booth Lumber Company.) The DAB previously supported this alteration.

Some rearrangement has occurred with the main carriage house doors, allowing them to be utilized for garage parking. If building openings are retained in the same pattern and visually reflect the original design, then the change may be determined to be minimal.

The southerly deck, while not original to the barn, is easily reversible.

2. *The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*

The massing, scale and proportion of the carriage barn is retained. Some alteration to the primary (easterly) façade bend the flexibility of alteration away from compliance with this standard. The enlarged central window opening, cuts into the gable ornament; a specific design feature of this building. While replacement of the three barn doors is proposed, their visual appearance will be important to understand. A spec sheet for the replacement doors has been provided, as has a spec for a new fir door for the pedestrian entrance.

3. *Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.*

The introduction of a small cottage may be considered, and is particularly supported with the submission of a historic photo of a similarly styled building in that location. The applicant has provided options for the gable end ornamentation.

4. *Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.*

None identified.

5. *Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.*

The gable end timbering of the carriage barn is among the most notable characteristics of the building.

6. *Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials recognizing that new technologies may provide an appropriate alternative in order to adapt to ever changing conditions and provide for an efficient contemporary use. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*

The application proposes the adaptation of an existing barn to residential use. Materials and features will be retained or replaced to match the old.

7. *Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.*

No chemical or physical treatments are proposed. Not applicable.

8. *Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.*

There are no identified archaeological resources at this location. Not applicable.

9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale, and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

Replacement windows and entry doors for the carriage barn will certainly read as new; their arrangement in existing openings will help retain the character of the structure.

The cottage will be detached and subservient to the principal, historic structure.

10. *New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

It is possible to consider the reversible nature of both of the accessory cottage structure and the wooden deck proposed for the carriage barn. Both could be removed at some future date without an adverse impact to the essential form and integrity of the overall historic property.

Items for the Board's consideration:

- Painted or demarked walkways must be introduced between parking areas and structures to separate vehicles from pedestrians.
- Revised building elevations shall be provided to understand features; particularly roof canopies over entrances, location of meters and mailboxes as well as utility connections where applicable.
- All parking spaces are proposed to be compact spaces, and all back-up space is inadequate to the requirements of the ordinance.
- Screening must be provided between parking areas and boundary lines to prevent headlight trespass onto neighboring properties.
- Electrical service shall be undergrounded.
- A clearly articulated landscape plan, including tree cutting and planting schedule (with species and location) shall be provided for review.
- The materials of decks and patios shall be provided.
- Roofing materials shall be defined.
- Lighting fixtures, proposed locations and illumination levels are required.
- If pervious pavement is proposed, it shall be designed and maintained to infiltrate the 1 year/24 hour storm event; and is subject to review and approval by the Stormwater Administrator.
- A breakdown of the coverage will be required to break out "bonus" coverage from base coverage, and to assure there is compliance with Article 4 of the ordinance.